

A Brief History of the Dissemination and Reception of Karl Marx's *Capital* in the United States and Britain

Author(s): Babak Amini

Source: *World Review of Political Economy*, Vol. 7, No. 3 (Fall 2016), pp. 334-349

Published by: Pluto Journals

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.13169/worlrevipoliecon.7.3.0334>

Accessed: 23-01-2017 14:59 UTC

REFERENCES

Linked references are available on JSTOR for this article:

http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.13169/worlrevipoliecon.7.3.0334?seq=1&cid=pdf-reference#references_tab_contents

You may need to log in to JSTOR to access the linked references.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://about.jstor.org/terms>



Pluto Journals is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *World Review of Political Economy*

A BRIEF HISTORY OF THE DISSEMINATION AND RECEPTION OF KARL MARX'S *CAPITAL* IN THE UNITED STATES AND BRITAIN

Babak Amini

Babak Amini is a PhD student in Sociology at the London School of Economics (London). He is a member of the editorial board of *Socialism and Democracy*. Among his recent publications is the edited book, *The Radical Left in Europe in the Age of Austerity* (Routledge, 2016). His research interests are the history of socialist ideas and workers' control organizations. Email: b.amini86@gmail.com



Abstract: The year 2017, which marks the 150th anniversary of Karl Marx's *Capital*, presents an occasion to review the history of one of the most influential books ever written. This article gives an overview of the dissemination and reception of *Capital* in the United States and Britain over the last 150 years. This article, which is part of a larger ongoing project of writing a global history of the dissemination and reception of *Capital* (Musto and Amini 2017), seeks to illuminate the path forward in interpreting this important book by identifying how and why Marx's most piercing insights into the foundation of the capitalist mode of production have been received, understood, misunderstood, or ignored by his opponents and proponents.

Key words: Karl Marx; *Capital*; history of ideas; Marx's reception in US and Britain

After years of theoretical excavation into the foundation of classical political economy, Karl Marx published the first volume of his magnum opus, *Capital: A Critique of Political Economy*, in 1867. Since then, it has been translated into dozens of languages (the exact number is yet unknown) and led to the creation of a branch of political economy often referred to as Marxist Economics. The year 2017, which marks the 150th anniversary of its first publication, provides an occasion to reassess the role of this monumental book in the world's intellectual history. This article focuses on the ways Marx's *Capital* has been propagated and taken up in Britain, and the United States.

Capital is notoriously "incomplete" since the first volume was the only one that was published in Marx's life time in the original German in 1867. Marx also

worked on the French translation of the first volume which came out in segments (1872–75), and the second German edition (1872) which incorporated some of the changes he made to the French edition. It was Engels who completed the third (1883) and fourth German edition (1890), prepared the second (1885) and third (1894) volumes of *Capital* for publication in German, and oversaw the English translation of the first volume (1887). The second and third volumes of *Capital* did not appear in English until after Engels's death (1895) in 1907 and 1909, respectively.

Accessibility and affordability of this voluminous book whose aim was never to become purely academic, read by a handful of high-minded intellectuals, but to inform the working class about the fundamental flaws of capitalist mode of production in the most theoretically rigorous way, has always been part of the preoccupation of Marxist activists and politically conscious publishers. This makes the inclusion of the partial and abridged versions of the book in the present discussion indispensable, especially important during the early periods before the first full translation of the book.

Setting the partial editions of *Capital* aside, the first volume has been translated into English by Edward B. Aveling¹ and Samuel Moore² (Swan Sonnenschein, Lowrey & Co., 1887), Eden and Cedar Paul³ (Allen & Unwin, 1928), and Ben Fowkes⁴ (Penguin Books and New Left Review, 1981). The second and third volumes have been translated into English by Ernest Untermann⁵ (Charles H. Kerr, 1907 and 1909) and David Fernbach⁶ (Penguin Books and New Left Review, 1978 and 1981). In what follows, we review the history of the dissemination and reception of *Capital* in Britain and the United States from 1867 to 2017 in three separate periods, 1867–1914, 1915–1989, 1990–2017.

The Dissemination and Reception 1867–1914

Even though Marx lived in London from 1848 to the end of his life, as Kirk Willis outlines in his article on the reception of Marxist thoughts in Britain in the second half of the 19th century, the process of dissemination of Marx's ideas in Britain was "slow and difficult" (1977, 418).

Excerpts of *Capital* first appeared in Britain in April 1883 after the magazine *Today: A Monthly Gathering of Bold Thoughts* published segments of a chapter of the book from the French edition, followed by a second part published in June of that year (420). One year after Henry M. Hyndman, the founder of the Social Democratic Federation, took over the ownership of the magazine, the retitled *To-Day: Monthly Magazine of Scientific Socialism* began translating the first ten chapters of the first volume of *Capital* from the German edition⁷ and publishing them in a series of articles from October 1885 through May 1889 (420). The first

complete translation of the first volume of *Capital* by Aveling and Moore was published, originally in two volumes, in England by Swan Sonnenschein, Lowrey & Co. ~~Even though the second and third volumes were not published until they were issued by a London publisher as soon as Charles H. Kerr publishing company released the books in 1907,~~ the publication of the first complete edition caused a breakthrough in the reception of Marx in England.⁸

On the other side of the Atlantic Ocean, the early dissemination of *Capital* went through a different journey. The landscape of the American left was profoundly different from that of Britain. One important aspect of this dissimilarity was the presence of a significant number of German socialists who had been immigrating to the United States since 1850 (Buhle 2013, 40–46). Their presence was so considerable that excerpts of *Capital* in German were published in the New York based German magazine *Arbeiter Union* from October 24, 1868, to June 17, 1869, and in *Neue Zeit* of New York on two occasions on May 13 and 27, 1871 (Foner 1967, 461).

In response to the growing number of individuals who joined the American section of the International Workingmen's Association (IWMA),⁹ the first English excerpts of the first volume was distributed by the International Sections of New York in 1872, under the title "The Workingmen's Voice on the Normal Working Day" (461). Systematic translation and publication of the first volume of *Capital* into English in the United States was initiated by the weekly journal *The Socialist*¹⁰ in 13 instalments¹¹ beginning from May 27, 1876 (462). It presented a popularized version of *Capital* by giving a chapter-by-chapter summary with some quotations by Marx. The translator of these instalments is unknown but Philip Foner speculated that it might be Adolph Douai, who emigrated to Texas in 1852 and devoted himself to Marxist ideas in 1867 after reading *Capital*. What gives more validity to this speculation is that we know Douai was working on the English translation of the book since in October 1877, when Marx provided a list of changes to the German texts to Friedrich Adolph Sorge, the leader of the American branch of the IWMA who emigrated to the United States in 1852, to give to Douai in order to help him in the translation process (464).

Labor Standard started a new article series, headlined "Extract from 'Capital' of Karl Marx" from December 30, 1877, to March 10, 1878, in ten instalments (464f12). These articles, whose translator is indicated as Otto Weydemeyer, the son of Joseph Weydemeyer who himself was one of the pioneers of American socialism, were later published as a pamphlet by Sorge (464).¹² The complete English edition of the first volume was imported to the United States after its publication in Britain by Swan Sonnenschein, Lowrey & Co.

Charles H. Kerr Publishing Company, established in 1886 under the control of Proletarian Party of America by Charles Hope Kerr, launched one of the most

important Socialist journals in America, *International Socialist Review* (ISR) in 1900.¹³ Charles H. Kerr, which systematically produced very cheap publications of Marx, Engels, Kautsky, among other Marxists, reprinted the first volume of *Capital* in 1906.¹⁴ The journal continued this project by commissioning Ernest Untermann, who was also on the editorial board of ISR, to translate the second and third volumes of *Capital*. The second and third volumes were published in English for the first time in 1907 and 1909, respectively.¹⁵

The first substantial analysis of Marx's economic writings that appeared in English was John McDonnell's article, "Karl Marx and German Socialism," published in *Fortnightly Review* (March 1875) (Willis 1977, 428). Although the article misleadingly portrayed Marx as the force behind German socialism and the uncontested successor of Lassalle, it became the gateway through which the British intellectuals became increasingly aware of Marx's importance in socialist movements of the continent. Leonard Montefiore introduced *Capital* to the reader as "the oracle of the socialist party" (Montefiore 1881, 104) and its economic principles the formulation of state monopoly of capital. The Scottish-Canadian economist, John Rae wrote two important articles in 1881, one on the influence of Lassalle on German Socialism, and another, entitled "The Socialism of Karl Marx and the Young Hegelians" in the journal *Contemporary Review*, which gave an account of Marx's life, philosophy, and economic theory. This remained an authoritative account of Marx's thoughts until 1890s (Willis 1977, 430).¹⁶

Since classical economics had been undergoing a tectonic paradigm shift away from the classical political economy into the marginalist theory after 1870, grappling with Marx's critique of political economy seemed less pressing among the economists. However, at the midst of a revival of socialist movements in Britain in 1880s and 1890s, British intellectuals were curious to know the tendencies that might direct the revived British socialist movements in the future and they needed to grasp the continental socialism more deeply. This finally made Marxist ideas important enough to be the subject of criticism. The reviews of Marxist thoughts written by prominent British and American economists were published in the leading journals at the time. Three economics books that contained substantial discussion on Marx and gained a wide audience were Theodore D. Woolsey's (1880) *Communism and Socialism in Their History and Theory*, Richard T. Ely's (1883) *French and German Socialism*, and Laurence Gronlund's (1884) *The Cooperative Commonwealth in Its Outlines: An Exposition of Modern Socialism*.¹⁷

An indispensable factor in the dissemination of Marx's works in Britain was the educational activities of Plebs' Leagues and labour colleges. It emerged after a group of students who were studying at the adult educational centre, Ruskin Hall, and asked for inclusion of more Marxist texts in the curriculum. They formed their own parallel study clubs in 1908 called, Plebs' Leagues. After the principal

of Ruskin House, Dennis Hird, who was sympathetic to the demands of these students was asked to resign in 1909, the students staged a solidarity strike and soon formed the Central Labour College in 1910. Other Plebs' Leagues, which organized numerous labour colleges and evening classes for the working class, were established rapidly in different parts of the country. Before World War I (WWI), the study of *Capital* in these labour colleges was limited to the first nine chapters and perhaps Aveling's companion to *Capital* (Macintyre 1980, 147). After the WWI until 1920s, the number of these classes significantly grew to the extent that there were not enough instructors to teach the courses. And in the case where there was no instructor, the students would collectively read from a text (sometimes *Capital*) (76–77). Since their influence was manifested most after 1917, we will come back to the influence of Plebs' League and labour colleges in the next section.

There were a number of books written by non-English authors, critically engaging with Marx's economic ideas, which were translated into English and became very influential in Britain. These include Albert Schäffle's *Kapitalismus und Sozialismus* (1870),¹⁸ Emile de Laveleye's *Le Socialisme Contemporain* (1881; translated into English in 1884), and Eugen von Böhm-Bawerk's *Karl Marx and the Close of His System* (1896; translated into English in 1898).¹⁹

Another influential reading of *Capital* among political activists in the United States was provided by the renowned American Marxist theorist, Louis B. Boudin, who published a series of articles in the *International Socialist Review* from May 1905 to October 1906 on Marx's economic and philosophical ideas. These articles were later published in 1907 by Charles H. Kerr as a book entitled, *Theoretical System of Karl Marx in the Light of Recent Criticism*, which was in print for the next twenty years.

The period of the Second International (1889–1914) marked the formation of the evolutionistic and deterministic interpretation of Marx, manifested in the notion of the impending collapse of capitalism and the automatic rise of socialism as the next phase in the progressive processes of historical evolution. In this period, Marx and Engels were known much less through their own writings than through the handful of commentaries that were written about their works.

The Dissemination and Reception 1915–1989

Although the Russian Revolution changed the prospects of Marxism in profound ways, it did not lead to an immediate change in the dissemination of Marx's original works in the Anglophone world. In fact, not much was added in the English language to the corpus of the classical writings of Marx between 1913 and 1930 (Hobsbawm 2011, 181–82). However, Marxology took a different turn after the

Russian Revolution through the works of the next generation of editors of the works of Marx and Engels. They deemed the German textual and interpretive work on Marx and Engels corpus as “opportunist distortion” (183). The establishment of the Marx-Engels Institute in 1920s under the directorship of David Riazanov led to a new wave of publications of some unpublished manuscripts, though mostly related to the early writings and some correspondence between Marx and Engels.

Although the availability of Marx and Engels work sharply increased as a result of these publications of the original manuscripts, “the [geographic] areas in which Marx and Engels could be published contracted sharply between 1933 and 1944” (186). Furthermore, “the circulation of the texts involved far more manuals of the party, handbooks, and ‘Marxist’ anthologies on various arguments, than texts by Marx himself” (Musto 2007, 482).

The second attempt to translate the first volume of *Capital* was done by Cedar and Eden Paul in 1928 for the publishing company, Allen & Unwin Ltd. Among numerous collaborative projects that the couple undertook together, they also translated the first volume of *Capital* from the 4th German edition.²⁰ In 1938, Allen & Unwin published an edited version of Moore and Aveling’s translation, edited by Dona Torr, which incorporated the 4th German edition and included Engels’s prefaces to the 3rd and 4th German edition (Mumby and Stallybrass 1955, 27).

It did not take long before the critical review of the new translation came out. One of the earliest reviews was written by Jack Fitzgerald, a prominent member of Socialist Party of Great Britain (SPGB), in the official organ of the party, the *Socialist Standard*, on March 1929. He complained that the publisher had exaggerated the difference between the 3rd and 4th German edition to diminish the Sonnenschein edition and that the translators had ignored the Untermann’s revised version of the first volume that had incorporated the changes made in the 4th German edition. Besides listing some of the typographical mistakes of the edition, he also bitterly condemned some of the translation choices such as the use of the term “machinofacture” as opposed to “manufacture” and “spiritual” as opposed to “intellectual” wants of the workers.

In a letter concerning this new translation on April 18, 1929,²¹ Riazanov expressed uncertainty about the need for a new translation of *Capital* rather than a revision of the old one. He also raised concern about the translators’ qualifications on economic matters to fully comprehend the complexity of the book. He mistakenly asserted that the new translation had neglected the editorial works done by Engels, even though this new translation was based on the 4th German edition as opposed to the 3rd German edition that Aveling and Moore used for their translation. Riazanov’s most damning objection to Pauls’ translation was their neglect of

Kausky's popular edition of *Capital*, referred to as "*Volksausgabe*." He complained that "Pauls have not made use of the best text hitherto known, therefore their translation is a step backwards" (1929). In addition to listing five translation errors from various parts of the book, he deemed the new translation as unjustified "from a scientific point of view superfluous," and unnecessary. Pauls sent a rebuttal to the editor of the *Labour Monthly* on June 2, 1929,²² in which they responded to the five specific points raised by Riazanov (1929) and articulated their notion of good translation: "it shall convey the author's meaning in a foreign tongue, and shall do so quickly, safely, and pleasantly." Although they agreed that "it might have been preferable to use Kautsky's *Volksausgabe*," they argued that their decision not to use it was due to copyrights issues, which would have been detrimental to producing a low-price edition of the book.

In response to the increasing demand for popular textbooks in Britain to help the thousands of students in their study of Marxist political economy,²³ Plebs' League published three textbooks which became widely used: *Easy Outline of Economics* in 1919 by one of the founders of Plebs' League, Noah Ablett (1919), *Outline of Economics* in 1922 by Will McLaine which sold 14,000 copies over the next decade, and *A Worker Looks at Economics* in 1925 by Mark Starr (Macintyre 1980, 148). An important popular text on Marx's *Capital* that was produced outside Plebs' League was *Karl Marx's Capital: An Introductory Essay* by A. D. Lindsay (1925) who was an academic involved in the Worker Education Association (WEA). Assisted by the state financially, the WEA was an adult education program, designed to counter the independent Marxist education of workers and offer "non-partisan" views (Macintyre 1980, 89). Like G. D. H. Cole, Lindsay was one of the first intellectuals who tried to separate Marx's labour theory of value from his theory of surplus value and make the latter stand independently of the former.

The most original British contribution to the Marxist political economy in the interwar period was certainly done by the Cambridge economist Maurice Dobb. He established the significant connection between Marx and classical political economists, especially David Ricardo, and showed how both schools were superior to the neo-classical economic theory. He also offered some original insights into the solutions to the common criticisms waged by neo-classical economists against Marxist economics. Although a committed member of the Communist Party of Great Britain (CPGB), he continued working with Plebs' League. After World War II (WWII), he produced one of the best short introductions to Marx's economist ideas under the title *Marx as an Economist*.

In the 1950s, Moscow became increasingly more interested in the systematic publication of Marxist texts in English as a way to amplify the reception of Marxist ideas in the world. The Foreign Languages Publishing House was the first attempt

towards this goal. It issued the three volumes of *Capital* annually from 1954 to 1959. Another Moscow-based publisher was Progress Publishers, founded in 1931, which engaged in printing the English edition of the three volumes of *Capital* from 1956 to 1978. These reprints used the Aveling and Moore for the first volume and an "extensive use" of Untermann's translation for the second and third volumes.

The third and perhaps the most influential initiative among English-speaking scholars of Marx was the launch of the Marx and Engels Collected Works (MECW), published by Progress Publishers in collaboration with London-based Lawrence & Wishart publishing company²⁴ and New York-based International Publisher.²⁵ This project, which is the most extensive collection of Marx and Engels works available in English, started in 1975 and continued until 2005, producing 50 volumes. Since the publication of *Capital* in the MECW was not undertaken until 1990s, the discussion of this edition is postponed to the later section of this article in order to remain chronologically consistent.

The decline of dogmatic Marxism after 1956 and the beginning of the de-Stalinization of the Soviet Union under Nikita Khrushchev led to the emergence of a new approach to Marxian scholarship in the 1960s. This new wave sought to interpret the writings of Marx and Engels "not a definitive and 'final' set of texts expanding the Marxist theory, but a process of developing thought" (Hobsbawm 2011, 189).

There was an upsurge in the publication of *Capital* in 1970s with new publishers joining the other traditional publishers of Marx's (1977) works. An important example of this was Penguin Classics which, in collaboration with the *New Left Review*, one of the most influential journals of the Left founded 1960 and the publishing force behind the emerging New Left in Britain, commissioned a new translation of *Capital*. Ben Fowkes, the translator of the new edition of the first volume of *Capital*, accompanied by a substantial introduction by Ernest Mandel,²⁶ gave three reasons why a new translation of *Capital* was necessary: the changes that English language itself has undergone in the past century, the immense advanced made by years of investigation into Marxist thoughts and previously unpublished original manuscripts which makes it unnecessary to "water down *Capital* in order to spare the reader" (87), and the introduction of the literary quality of the original German that was omitted in the previous English translation of the book. Although the new translation of the first volume was published in 1979, it took a few more years before the new translation of the second and third volumes, done by David Fernbach, finally came out in press in 1978 and 1981.

In a critical article about this new translation, Kevin Anderson (1983) argued for taking the French edition of *Capital* more seriously by pointing out the crucial

differences between the French, which, as mentioned before, was substantially revised by Marx himself, and even the original German edition. He contradicted Fowkes's claim that the French version of the book was taken into account, arguing that, with some exceptions, Fowkes has followed the edition of *Capital* as it appeared in the Marx-Engels Werke (Volume 34) which is based on Engels's 4th German edition with a few additions. Anderson believed that the French version has key passages on the most controversial issues including accumulation and fetishism of commodity (75–77). Furthermore, Anderson pointed out to some passages that were eliminated in the Marx-Engels Werke edition even though it was in the previous English translation (76).

There were a number of important companions and books written on Marx's *Capital* in this period. Some of the notable titles among them are Ben Fine's (1975) *Marx's Capital*, based on a course he gave at University of London on Marxian Economics, which has gone through six editions by 2016;²⁷ Roman Rosdolsky's *The Making of Marx's Capital* focuses on the comparative reading of *Grundrisse* and *Capital*, as well as the methodology that Marx deployed in *Capital*; Ben Fine and Laurence Harris's (1979) *Rereading Capital*, which, after an overview of Marx's key arguments into the foundation of political economy such as his labour theory of value and the tendency of the rate of profit to fall, critically, albeit highly abstractly, engaged with the literature of political economy in 1970s; and Duncan Foley's (1986) *Understanding Capital: Marx's Economic Theory*, which in a concise format explained the significance of Marx's labour theory of value and elaborates on it by incorporating feminist concerns about reproductive labour.

Focusing on the reception of *Capital* in this period rather than Marx more generally, which certainly extends to philosophy especially in the works of Sidney Hook and the Frankfurt School philosophers such as Herbert Marcuse and to history in the works of E. P. Thompson, we have to mention the influence of Louis Althusser and Etienne Balibar's *Reading Capital*, published in English in 1970, which, although going beyond the economic reading of Marx's thoughts, still gave a highly structuralist interpretation of *Capital* by portraying it as purely scientific.

But the role of *Capital* in shaping the intellectual current of Anglophone intellectuals is nowhere more apparent than in political economy. A number of highly original elaborations on Marx's arguments in *Capital* were espoused by works such as Paul Sweezy's (1942) *Theory of Capitalist Development*, Paul Baran's (1957) *The Political Economy of Growth*, and Baran and Sweezy's (1966) *Monopoly Capital*. These works posed a serious challenge to Marx's contentious theory of the tendency of the rate of profit to fall, as expressed in the third volume of *Capital*. Baran and Sweezy argued that the cause of the capitalist crisis is not in the production but the realization of surplus value (McLellan 1979, 325). Their view was later criticized by a number of Marxist theorists including Ernest Mandel.

After the disastrous failure of the Vietnam War, the opposition to which led to an increase in the popularity of Marxist thoughts especially those with Maoist tendencies, Paul Mattick (1969) wrote *Marx and Keynes* in which he elaborated on the theory of the autonomy of the capitalist state and stressed “the inherent limits that the state experienced in dealing with the surplus value” (McLellan 1979, 327). Moreover, James O’Connor’s (1973) *The Fiscal Crisis of the State* and Harry Braverman’s (1974) *Labour and Monopoly Capital* fall within the research path laid out by *Capital*.

The Dissemination and Reception 1990–2017

After the fall of the Berlin Wall and the eventual dissolution of the Soviet Union, there was a general silence in Marxian studies in the 1990s. Even the regular publication of *Capital* by large publishers such as Penguin substantially declined during this decade. However, there were attempts to break through the silence. Chris Arthur published a condensed version of the first volume of *Capital* in 1992 with Lawrence & Wishart under the title, *Marx’s Capital: A Student Edition* (Marx 1992).²⁸ Another important exception in this period of relative silence was the publication of the *Capital* in the MECW in the second half of the 1990s by Progress Publishers, Lawrence & Wishart, and International Publisher.

The first volume of *Capital* in the MECW, published in 1996 (volume 35 in the series), is based on the first English edition, with indications of any significant textual divergence between the English translation and the German editions, as well as some addenda to the 4th German edition made by Engels. In the translation of quotations from foreign languages such as Italian and Latin, this edition draws from Ben Fowkes’s translation. The second volume follows the English edition published by Progress Publishers which was on the basis of the 2nd German edition published in 1893. The terminology used in this volume is chosen to be consistent with that used in the first translation of the first volume approved by Engels. The second volume of *Capital* was published in 1997 (volume 36 in the series). Finally, the third volume, published in 1998, is based on the 1959 English edition of *Capital* published by Foreign Language Publishing House which also made extensive use of Untermann’s 1909 edition (volume 37 in the series).

A new wave of substantial companions to *Capital* appeared in the late 20th and early 21st century, with two edited works on volume one and two of *Capital*, *The Circulation of Capital: Essays on Volume Two of Marx’s Capital* (1998) edited by Christopher J. Arthur and Geert Reuten, and *The Constitution of Capital: Essays on Volume I of Marx’s Capital* (2004) edited by Riccardo Bellofiore and Nicola

Taylor, as well as Andrew Kliman's *Reclaiming Marx's "Capital"* (2006), David Harvey's two volume *A Companion to Marx's Capital* (2010, 2013) and the translation of the Michael Heinrich's *An Introduction to the Three Volumes of Karl Marx's Capital* (2012). In addition to an exponential expansion of electronic versions of *Capital*, which makes it far more accessible to readers than ever before in history, there has been creative attempts to make the arguments presented in *Capital* more accessible to the general audience. For example, Harvey has put out a series of video lectures of his close reading of *Capital* volume one and two (with some parts of the third volume) on his website.²⁹ Richard D. Wolff has also made a series of introductory video lectures on Marxian economics available on YouTube.³⁰

In April 2014, Lawrence & Wishart's decision to withdraw their consent to grant free access to the MECW, which was available online through the website Marxist.org at the time, shocked many. The website was given a few weeks to take down all copyrighted materials or face lawsuit. The publishing company cited financial difficulty to remain in business for this decision. Despite a huge online petition to appeal this decision, signed by more than 4,500 individuals, the materials were taken down from the website on Labour Day, May 1, 2014.

In addition to a host of articles that have appeared in recent years on various aspects of *Capital* in leading journals such as *Science & Society*, *Historical Materialism*, and *Rethinking Marxism*, there has been a number of books directly on *Capital* published in Historical Materialism book series (Brill), the largest series of its kind in the English-speaking world focusing on topics of Marxist theory. This certainly shows the renewal and growing interest in a study of *Capital*.

In the light of the publication of the most extensive textual collection related to *Capital* in the second section of *Marx-Engels-Gesamtausgabe* (MEGA), which includes all the original manuscripts of *Capital* and its preliminary studies from 1857, there have been calls for a new English translation of *Capital* to reflect the recent scholarly advancement in Marxology.

There is no doubt that we are at the beginning of a new phase in dissemination and reception of *Capital* in English which is by far the most widespread language in the world. It is very likely that there will be a new English translation of *Capital* to accompany the new wave of scholarly work on the writings of Marx that grapple with contentious interpretations of his ideas and dogmatic readings of his texts in the past 150 years. Recently, there have been attempts to write the history of *Capital* in the world, one of which is made by the renowned British journalist and writer, Francis Wheen, who published a small book under the title, *Marx's Das Kapital* (2007). Although this book offered an engaging account of the process of production, dissemination, and reception of *Capital* in the world, it

lacked scholarly rigour to contribute to the existing historical knowledge in any substantial way. This article, which is part of a larger ongoing project of writing a global history of the dissemination and reception of *Capital*, is intended to illuminate the path forward by tracing the evolution of this book which has been changing our history in profound and irreversible ways.

Notes

1. A founding member of the Socialist League and The Independent Labour Party, Edward B. Aveling (1849–1898) was an English biologist who gave numerous lectures on Darwinian evolution and socialism. Due to his strong atheist and left-wing political views, he could not continue teaching biology at King's College. From 1884, he became the partner of Eleanor Marx, Karl Marx's youngest daughter, and with her, toured the United States to deliver speeches on behalf of the Socialist Labor Party of America. In 1884, Engels asked him to help Samuel Moore with the translation of the first volume of *Capital*. In 1892, he wrote one of the earliest companions to Marx's *Capital*, entitled *The Students' Marx: An Introduction to the Study of Karl Marx's Capital*, published by Swan Sonnenschein, Lowrey & Co.
2. A judge in Manchester and an old friend of Marx and Engels, Samuel Moore (1830–1895) collaborated with Engels to re-translate *The Communist Manifesto* in 1888. Contrary to Aveling who had not read *Capital* in German until April 1884 (Kapp 1976, 116), Moore read the first volume upon its German publication and undertook years of studying to improve his knowledge of political economy as well as Marx's unique style before undergoing the translation of *Capital* (113–14). His reoccupation with other tasks and scrupulousness towards details made the progress too slow. This led both Moore and Engels to conclude that they need to bring someone else on board to help with the translation. In Spring of 1884, Engels approached Edward B. Aveling to undertake the translation of a portion of the first volume.
3. A physician, socialist writer, and translator, Eden Paul (1865–1944) was a member of the Independent Labour Party (1907–19) before joining the Communist Party of Great Britain. He worked for the French Socialist Party (1912–14). He wrote and translated a number of books concerning socialism such as *Karl Marx and Modern Socialism* (Manchester: National Labour Press, 1911) and Otto Rühle's *Karl Marx: His Life and Work* (New York: New Home Library, 1943). A singer, writer, and translator, Cedar Paul (1880–1972) was a member of Independent Labour Party (1912–19) and the Secretary of British section of the Women's International Council of Socialist and Labour Organizations (1917–19). She joined the Communist Party of Britain and served in the executive committee of Plebs' League. She translated a number of influential books such as Rudolf Hilferding's *Böhm-Bawerk's Criticism of Marx* (Glasgow: Socialist Labour Press, 1919), and the edited volume by David Riazanov, *Karl Marx, Man, Thinker, and Revolutionist: A Symposium* (London: M. Lawrence, 1927).
4. A professor of History and the author of a number of books, Ben Fowkes translated a number of other important books such as *Karl Marx: The Economic Manuscript of 1863–1865* (Boston: Brill, 2015).
5. A German-American sailor, socialist writer and translator, Ernest Untermann (1864–1956) was a member of the Socialist Labor Party of America in 1890s before joining the Socialist Party of America. He was a regular contributor of the *International Socialist Review* and the first translator of the second and third volume of *Capital*. He started working on the translation for Charles H. Kerr in 1905 and completed the work on the two volumes in 1907 and 1909, respectively. He wrote a companion to Marx's *Capital* entitled *Marxian Economics: A Popular Introduction to*

- the Three Volumes of Marx's Capital* (Chicago: Charles H. Kerr, 1907). He strongly supported the American Federation of Labor and opposed syndicalist movements such as the Industrial Workers of the World. His book *Science and Revolution* was translated into Russian in 1923.
6. A freelance author, editor, and translator, David Fernbach has published three edited volumes of Marx's political writings (Penguin, 1973–74; reprinted by Verso, 2010) (see Marx 2010a, 2010b, 2010c).
 7. Although it is indicated in the magazine that the translation was done from the original German, Hyndman's biographer Chushichi Tsuzuki claims that this was probably done from the French edition (1961, 60).
 8. The book was printed four times in four years. The first nine chapters were published in the Bellamy Library book series in 1893 which underwent four editions until 1902. By 1896, it was published as part of the Half Guinea International Library. The Social Democratic Federation published a cheap version of the first nine chapters in 1897 (Willis 1977, 442).
 9. The membership of the American branch of the IWMA reached its peak in 1972 to approximately 4,000 members (Musto 2014, 68).
 10. *The Socialist* was founded on April 15, 1876, as the newspaper of Social Democratic Workingmen's Party of North America (founded in 1874 by Lassalleans).
 11. The 12th and 13th instalment were published in *Labor Standard*, which came about after the rebranding of *The Socialist* in 1876.
 12. Otto Weydemeyer used the second edition of Johann Most's commentary of the first volume of *Capital* which underwent a significant revision by Marx himself and published in May 1876 (Foner 1967, 465).
 13. The journal was a great success with 3,200 subscribers and 10,000 sold copies by the end of the first year.
 14. For this version, Ernest Untermann revised and amplified the Aveling and Moore's translation according to the 4th German edition.
 15. In 1917, the government of the United States cut the mailing privilege of Charles H. Kerr and accused it of violating the espionage act.
 16. This article was published as part of a book by Rae under the title *Contemporary Socialism* (1884) which was reprinted in 1891 and 1901.
 17. This book, whose introduction was written by the famous socialist playwright George Bernard Shaw, was reprinted 10 times before 1900 and reviewed widely including by the American socialist writer, Edward Bellamy.
 18. Although this book was not translated into English, Moritz Kaufmann published a popular version of it in 1874 entitled, *Socialism: Its Nature, Its Dangers, and Its Remedies Considered*.
 19. This was a republication of the section in his three volume book *Kapital und Kapitalismus* which is dedicated to a critique of Marx.
 20. Engels finished the 3rd German edition of the first volume of *Capital* in 1883. This edition took into account some small changes made in the French edition, published in a serial form from 1872 to 1875 in which Marx made substantial revisions. He repeated the process with more thorough consideration of the French version and published the definitive 4th German edition in 1890.
 21. This letter was first published in *Labour Monthly* on May 1929.
 22. This letter was published in the February, July 1929 issue of *Labour Monthly*.
 23. There were 11,933 students enrolled in the classes organized by National Council of Labour, an umbrella organization that coordinated the activities of Plebs' League, Central Labour College, and local labour colleges. This number increased to 31,635 in 1926–27 (Macintyre 1980, 78).

24. After a merger between the British Communist Party Press, Martin Lawrence, and an anti-fascist liberal publishing company, Wishart Ltd., Lawrence & Wishart was founded in 1936. It engaged in translating works of Antonio Gramsci in the 1970s and has continued publishing Marxist literature to this day.
25. Founded in 1924, International Publishers worked closely with the Communist Party of USA and later became the party's publishing branch in New York. It published a house of influential Marxist literature including the first English translation of works of Kautsky, Trotsky, and Stalin, among others. One of the founders, Alexander Trachtenberg, was summoned to testify in front of the Congress in 1939 about the relation between the publishing house and the Communist Party of USA.
26. Ernest Mandel (1923–1995) was a prominent Marxist theorist who was active in the International Trotskyist movement.
27. Since the fourth edition in 2004, the book is listed under the joint authorship of Ben Fine and Alfredo Saad-Filho. Ben Fine explains this change in the preface of the book: "This has been in order to refresh the text that remains from earlier editions and to add refreshing new text drawing on Alfredo's significant contribution to value theory" (xvi).
28. This edition uses the 1887 English edition of the first volume, translated from the 3rd German edition by Aveling and Moore.
29. With a total of 25 recorded lecture averaging 1 hour and 30 minutes each, this series is accessible for free on <http://davidharvey.org/reading-capital/>
30. Available at <https://www.youtube.com/user/RichardDWolff/playlists>.

References

- Ablett, N. 1919. *Easy Outline of Economics*. Sheffield: Plebs' League.
- Althusser, L., and É. Balibar. 1970. *Reading Capital*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Anderson, K. 1983. "The 'Unknown' Marx's Capital, Volume I: The French Edition of 1872–75, 100 Years Later." *Review of Radical Political Economics* 15 (4): 71–80.
- Arthur, C. J., and G. Reuten, eds. 1998. *The Circulation of Capital: Essays on Volume Two of Marx's Capital*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Baran, P. A. 1957. *The Political Economy of Growth*. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Baran, P. A., and P. M. Sweezy. 1966. *Monopoly Capital: An Essay on the American Economic and Social Order*. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Bellofiore, R., and N. Taylor, eds. 2004. *The Constitution of Capital: Essays on Volume I of Marx's Capital*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Braverman, H. 1974. *Labor and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century*. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Buhle, P. 2013. *Marxism in the United States: A History of the American Left*. Brooklyn: Verso.
- Dobb, M. 1946. *Marx as an Economist*. London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Ely, R. T. 1883. *French and German Socialism in Modern Times*. New York: Harper & Brothers.
- Fine, B. 1975. *Marx's Capital*. Macmillan Studies in Economics. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Fine, B., and A. Saad-Filho. 2004. *Marx's Capital*. 4th ed. London: Pluto Press.
- Fine, B., and L. Harris. 1979. *Rereading Capital*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Foley, D. K. 1986. *Understanding Capital: Marx's Economic Theory*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Foner, P. S. 1967. "Marx's 'Capital' in the United States." *Science & Society* 31 (4): 461–66.

- Fowkes, B. 2015. *Karl Marx: The Economic Manuscript of 1863–1865*. Boston: Brill.
- Gronlund, L. 1884. *The Cooperative Commonwealth in Its Outlines: An Exposition of Modern Socialism*. New York: Lee and Shepard Publishers.
- Harvey, D. 2010. *A Companion to Marx's Capital*. London: Verso.
- Harvey, D. 2013. *A Companion to Marx's Capital*. Vol. 2. London: Verso.
- Heinrich, M. 2012. *An Introduction to the Three Volumes of Karl Marx's Capital*. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Hilferding, R. 1919. *Böhm-Bawerk's Criticism of Marx*. Glasgow: Socialist Labour Press.
- Hobsbawm, E. J. 2011. *How to Change the World: Reflections on Marx and Marxism*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Kapp, Y. 1976. *Eleanor Marx: Volume II—The Crowded Years (1884–1898)*. London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Kliman, A. 2006. *Reclaiming Marx's "Capital": A Refutation of the Myth of Inconsistency*. Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Laveleye, E. 1881. *Le Socialisme Contemporain*. Bruxelles: C. Muquardt.
- Lindsay, A. D. 1925. *Karl Marx's Capital: An Introductory Essay*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Macintyre, S. 1980. *A Proletarian Science: Marxism in Britain, 1917–1933*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Marx, K. 1977. *Capital: A Critique of Political Economy*. Translated by B. Fowkes. New York: Random House.
- Marx, K. 1992. *Marx's Capital: A Student Edition*. Edited by C. J. Arthur. London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Marx, K. 2010a. *The First International and After: Political Writings*. Edited by D. Fernbach. London: Verso.
- Marx, K. 2010b. *The Revolutions of 1848: Political Writings*. Edited by D. Fernbach. New York: Verso.
- Marx, K. 2010c. *Surveys from Exile: Political Writings*. Edited by D. Fernbach. New York: Verso.
- Mattick, P. 1969. *Marx and Keynes: The Limits of the Mixed Economy*. Extending Horizons Books. Boston: P. Sargent.
- McLaine, W. 1922. *An Outline of Economics*. London: Plebs' League.
- McLellan, D. 1979. *Marxism after Marx: An Introduction*. London: Macmillan.
- Montefiore, L. A. 1881. *Essays and Letters Contributed to Various Periodicals between September 1877 and August 1879, Together with Some Unpublished Fragments*. London: Privately Printed.
- Mumby, F. A., and F. H. S. Stallybrass. 1955. *From Swan Sonnenschein to George Allen & Unwin Ltd.* London: George Allen & Unwin.
- Musto, M. 2007. "The Rediscovery of Karl Marx." *International Review of Social History* 52 (3): 477–98.
- Musto, M., ed. 2014. *Workers Unite! The International 150 Years Later*. New York: Bloomsbury.
- Musto, M., and B. Amini, eds. 2017. *The Dissemination of Marx's "Capital" in the World (1867–2017)*. Special issue of *Socialism and Democracy* 31 (1): Forthcoming.
- O'Connor, J. 1973. *The Fiscal Crisis of the State*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Paul, E. 1911. *Karl Marx and Modern Socialism*. Manchester: National Labour Press.
- Paul, E., and C. Paul. 1929. "Correspondence—The New Translation of 'Capital'." *Labour Monthly* (Feb., Jul.): 446–48. Accessed July 16, 2016. <https://www.marxists.org/archive/riazanov/1929/07/translation-critique.htm>.
- Rae, J. 1884. *Contemporary Socialism*. New York: C. Scribner's Sons.
- Riazanov, D. 1927. *Karl Marx, Man, Thinker, and Revolutionist: A Symposium*. London: M. Lawrence.

- Riazanov, D. 1929. "The New Translation of Marx." *Labour Monthly* (May). Accessed July 16, 2016.
<https://www.marxists.org/archive/riazanov/1929/04/new-translation.htm>.
- Ruhle, O. 1943. *Karl Marx: His Life and Work*. New York: New Home Library.
- Schäffle, A. 1870. *Kapitalismus und Sozialismus*. Tübingen: Laupp.
- Starr, M. 1925. *A Worker Looks at Economics*. London: Labour Publishing.
- Sweezy, P. M. 1942. *The Theory of Capitalist Development: Principles of Marxian Political Economy*.
New York: Oxford University Press.
- Tsuzuki, C. 1961. *H. M. Hyndman and British Socialism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Untermann, E. 1907. *Marxian Economics: A Popular Introduction to the Three Volumes of Marx's Capital*. Chicago: Charles H. Kerr.
- von Böhm-Bawerk, E. 1898. *Karl Marx and the Close of His System*. London: T. F. Unwin.
- Willis, K. 1977. "The Introduction and Critical Reception of Marxist Thought in Britain, 1850–1900."
The Historical Journal 20 (2): 417–59.
- Woolsey, T. D. 1880. *Communism and Socialism in Their History and Theory: A Sketch*. New York: Scribner.